

**Partnership for Transparency Fund (PTF)
Project Completion Assessment**

Anabel Cruz

Montevideo, Uruguay, 5 December 2003

Projects: *Transparência Brasil (TB)*

Introduction

In 2001, PTF supported *Transparência Brasil (TB)* for the implementation of two projects: (i) the creation of a procurement website, and (ii) participation of TB in the Sao Paulo Municipality Anti Corruption Program. PTF grants amounted for US\$ 5,000 for the first project, while the second project was supported with US\$ 7,650.

An assessment of the two projects has been conducted in December 2003, guided by a methodology including: (a) review of pertinent literature and materials related to the projects, and (b) a brief site visit to *Transparência Brasil (TB)* in Sao Paulo and interviews with key staff members (Claudio Weber Abramo and Bruno Wilhelm Speck). An interview was also held with Ms. Marilena Lazzarini, a renowned Brazilian civic and consumer leader and experts in Governance and Public Administration at the Institute of Public Policy of the University of Sao Paulo were also consulted.

1. *Procurement website*

Objectives, Project Design and Implementation Experience

The original objectives of the project seem to be very appropriate to the problem that had been detected and aimed to be addressed. The main objective of the project was to develop an interactive internet website intended to generate better knowledge of the procurement laws and the Brazilian Constitution for diverse type of users such as companies, public officers, lawyers, journalists, CSO. The site would guide transparent local government procurement. PTF's grant was used to cover the costs for the logical design of the interactive website.

The project (design of the website) was carried out as planned, though the main issues seem to be related to the conception of the project and its negotiation process, both with PTF and later with other donors. The PTF grant was aimed to cover the design costs (payment of consultant fees), but there was never real guarantee for the funding of the remaining tasks of the project (approx. US\$ 50,000). Apparently, there has also been a sort of

miscommunication or misunderstanding: *Transparência Brasil (TB)* expected PTF to fund the whole project or at least to leverage funds for the completion of the project. According to their interpretation and what they have expressed during the site visit, had they “*been aware of the unfeasibility of a larger PTF grant for the whole project, the design would have not been done nor submitted as a partial project*”.

Even though an elaborate design was achieved, the specific objective for which the grant was approved, the interactive website project, could not be implemented. In turn, new donors had to be put in place and the Tinker Foundation was suggested and approached, but no good results were obtained. No other funding has been secured so far and it is unlikely, according to what it was perceived, that new funding sources will be approached. Nevertheless, it should be recommendable for TB to analyze the possibility of seeking for new and additional funds to complete the project.

Impact and Lessons learned

The implementation experience has then critically affected the outcome and the sole design (PTF grant) could not be used for further development of the project, since funding was not available. In this sense, and due to the fact that the website was not created, no visible or real measurable impact on corruption in Brazil can be reported as a consequence of the project. One could then easily conclude that the goals were not reached, but this should be a simplistic conclusion.

The activities undertaken have helped the organization to generate institutional capacities and to reflect about the crucial importance of planning and taking into account the diverse variables. The experiences achieved thanks to the design can now help and the model can be used in the design of a specific tool for the Accounting Board of the State of Santa Catarina, which can be replicated for other States in Brazil. TB is in the process of designing such tool.

Lessons can also be extracted for PTF. It seems that a thorough review should be necessary in the case of projects submitted to PTF which cannot ensure clear outcomes and outputs. If the project is depending on further funding which is not yet secured, PTF should consider either to expand its funding (if feasible) to allow a complete implementation as possible, or to ask for specific reformulations in the original project. If none of the mentioned options is possible, not to concede the funding can be the final decision.

2. Sao Paulo Anti Corruption Program

Objectives, Project Design and Implementation Experience

PTF assisted *Transparência Brasil (TB)* to play a role in formulating an Anti-Corruption action plan for the City of Sao Paulo, in cooperation with the Municipality of Sao Paulo and the World Bank Institute. The Anti-Corruption Plan followed an agreement between the Municipality of Sao Paulo and the World Bank Institute and would imply four different phases: diagnosis, action plan, public seminar and implementation of control mechanisms. PTF grant (US\$ 7,650) was approved to strengthen *Transparência Brasil (TB)* participation in the Program, with specific tasks and objectives (supervision of a survey about perceptions of corruption by providers and public officials at the Municipality and citizens and representatives of corporations; report drafting, final report, etc). DFID, United Kingdom, supported the first phase of the project.

Transparência Brasil (TB) saw its participation, specially the preparation of the report as “a unique opportunity to gain insight into the transparency –or lack of it, of the administration of one of the biggest cities in the world” (see original TB’ s project proposal).

The implementation process was slow: the survey was prepared in 2001 and it was applied in 2002, with a final report and analysis by the end of 2002. The Municipality presented several reservations to the report (which indicated the local government feared how its own image would be represented in the report) and suggested several changes, which in turn were introduced by TB into the report.

The delays and obstacles constantly introduced by the Municipality to make the report public (although its dissemination was an original commitment agreed by all parts) prompted TB to distribute the report unilaterally, a step clearly not endorsed by the Municipality of Sao Paulo. The World Bank did not either take a firm position in the process.

Impact and Lessons learned

The impact of the report with media has been modest and not the one it has been initially expected, but it represents an increasing information source and reference. Articles have appeared in some written media and radio and TV interviews with TB officers informed about the report. The report is also available online at the TB internet website, which shows increasing numbers as far as visits to the site and downloads of the report are concerned.

Given that State and Municipality elections in Sao Paulo are to be held in 2004, the report will represent a reference for journalists, civil society and also for those running for office, who will surely use many of the data contained in the report.

In part as a consequence of the process related above, *Transparência Brasil (TB)* currently has not a good relationship with the Municipality of Sao Paulo, ruled by the PT- Partido dos Trabalhadores, the same party that rules at national level. In fact, TB states that the new President of Brazil has not respected the anti-corruption points that agreed with TB before his election.

Even if TB work can encounter some obstacles at the short term, its independent position can yield good image, recognition and respect. This opinion was specially stressed by informants not involved with TB.

Transparência Brasil (TB) is aware of the need of reflecting about the conditions for local governments (State, Municipalities) to implement anti-corruption plans and how to lobby local governments for systematic processes. TB is also aware of how difficult it can be to mobilize public opinion to influence the behavior of the Municipality to be more transparent and accountable or to take fighting corruption seriously, and is taking these reflections into account for its current and future work.

Corrupcao na municipalidade de Sao Paulo. Levantamento de percepcoes, experiencias e valores. Relatorio. Transparencia Brasil, September 2003